

# INTRODUCTION TO ENVIRONMENTAL LAW

FALL 2004

VOLUME II

Prof. Andrew Green



BOBA LACKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP - 1 2004


FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

**INTRODUCTION TO ENVIRONMENTAL LAW**

**FALL 2004**

**VOLUME II**

**Prof. Andrew Green**



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

# INTRODUCTION TO ENVIRONMENTAL LAW

FALL 2004

## I THE PROBLEM AND APPROACHES

D. Boyd, <i>Unnatural Law: Rethinking Canadian Environmental Law and Policy</i> (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2003), Ch. 1: “Canada’s Environmental Record .....	1
K. Harrison and W. Antweiler, “Incentives for Pollution Abatement: Regulation, Regulatory Threats and Non-Governmental Pressures” (2003) 22(3) <i>J. Policy Analysis and Management</i> 361 [Excerpt].....	7
G. Hardin, “The Tragedy of the Commons” (1968) 162 <i>Science</i> 1243 [Excerpt].....	19
R. Coase, <i>The Firm, The Market, and The Law</i> (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1988), Ch. 5: “The Problem of Social Cost” [pp. 95-104, 114-119].....	22
Aldo Leopold, <i>A Sand County Almanac</i> (New York: Oxford University Press, 1966) [pp. 217- 241].....	31
C. Stone, “Should Trees have Standing? – Towards Legal Rights for Natural Objects” (1972) 45 <i>Southern Cal. L.R.</i> 450 [Title page, pp. 458-481].....	44
C. Giagnocavo and H. Goldstein, “Law Reform or World Re-form: The Problem of Environmental Rights” (1990) 35 <i>McGill L.J.</i> 345 [pp. 375-386].....	57

## II COMMON LAW

J. Benedickson, <i>Environmental Law (2d)</i> (Toronto: Irwin Law, 2002), Ch. 5: “Civil Liability for Environmental Harm”.....	64
<i>McKie v. The K.V.P. Co.</i> , [1948] O.R. 398 (Ont. High Ct.).....	73
<i>McKie v. The K.V.P. Co.</i> , [1949] 1 D.L.R. 39 (Ont. C.A.).....	84
<i>The K.V.P. Co. v. McKie</i> , [1949] S.C.R. 698.....	87
<i>British Columbia v. Canadian Forest Products Ltd.</i> , 2004 SCC 38 [Excerpt].....	91
F. Ackerman and L. Heinzerling, <i>Priceless</i> (New York: The New Press, 2004) [pp. 153-165].....	107

### *Class Actions*

<i>Hollick v. Toronto (City)</i> (2001), 42 C.E.L.R. (N.S.) 26 (S.C.C.).....	114
<i>Pearson v. Inco Ltd.</i> (2002), 33 C.P.C. (5 <sup>th</sup> ) 264 (Ont. Sup. Ct. J.).....	124
<i>Pearson v. Inco Ltd.</i> (2004), 44 C.P.C. (5 <sup>th</sup> ) 276 (Ont. Sup. Ct. J., Div. Ct.).....	148
T. Camus, “Sydney Families File \$1-billion Suit” <i>Halifax Herald</i> (March 25, 2004)...	155
T. Collier MacDonald. “Another 80 People to Join Lawsuit” <i>Cape Breton Post</i> (August 30, 2003).....	157

### *Statutory Reforms*

<i>Environmental Bill of Rights</i> , S.O. 1993, c. 28, s. 84.....	158
--	-----

## III CONSTITUTIONAL JURISDICTION

### *Theory*

R. Revesz, “Rehabilitating Interstate Competition: Rethinking the ‘Race-to-the-Bottom’ Rationale for Federal Environmental Regulation” (1992) 67 N.Y.U. L. Rev. 1210 [pp. 1210-19, 1233-44].....	160
R. Revesz, “Federalism and Environmental Regulation: A Public Choice Analysis” (2001) 115 <i>Harv. L.R.</i> 553 [pp. 555-578].....	172
D. Esty, “Revitalizing Environmental Federalism” (1996) 95(3) <i>Mich. L.R.</i> 570 [Excerpts].....	185

### *Federal/Provincial Relations*

Harrison, “Federal-Provincial Relations and the Environment: Unilateralism, Collaboration and Rationalization” in D. VanNijnatten and R. Boardman, eds., <i>Canadian Environmental Policy: Context and Cases</i> (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 2001), p. 123.....	197
<i>R. v. Crown Zellerbach Canada Ltd.</i> (1988), 49 D.L.R. (4 <sup>th</sup> ) 161 (S.C.C.) [pp. 161-77, 183-89, 193-196, 200-4].....	209
<i>R. v. Hydro Quebec</i> (1997), 151 D.L.R. (4 <sup>th</sup> ) 32 (S.C.C.) [pp. 32-36, 43-44, 56-61, 63-64, 67-69, 71-76, 77-79, 96-102, 113-6].....	228

## *Local Government*

<i>114957 Canada Ltee v. Hudson (Town)</i> (2001), 200 D.L.R. (4 <sup>th</sup> ) 419 [pp. 419-27, 432-445] .....	253
--	-----

## *Aboriginal*

I. McClenaghan, "Why Should Aboriginal Peoples Exercise Governance Over Environmental Issues" (2002) 51 UNB LJ 211.....	265
---	-----

## **IV REGULATORY APPROACH**

### *Overview*

J. Benedickson, <i>Environmental Law (2d)</i> (Toronto: Irwin Law, 2002), Ch. 6: "Environmental Regulations and Approvals" .....	276
--	-----

### *Standards*

D. Boyd, <i>Unnatural Law: Rethinking Canadian Environmental Law and Policy</i> (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2003), Ch. 3.3: "Air Pollution".....	285
---	-----

MOE, <i>Updating Ontario's Regulatory Framework for Local Air Quality: A Position Paper</i> (April 2004).....	294
---	-----

K. Arrow, et al., "Is There a Role for Benefit-Cost Analysis in Environmental, Health, and Safety Regulation?" (1996) 272 Science 221.....	313
--	-----

F. Ackerman and L. Heinzerling, <i>Priceless</i> (New York: The New Press, 2004) [pp. 35-40; 66-75].....	315
--	-----

C. Sunstein, <i>Risk and Reason</i> (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), Ch. 5: "Reducing Risks Rationally" [pp. 99-113, 120-132].....	324
--	-----

D. Farber, "From Here to Eternity: Environmental Law and Future Generations" (2003) 2 U. Ill. L.R. 289 [pp. 289-308].....	339
---	-----

D. Dana, "A Behavioral Economic Defense of the Precautionary Principle" (2003) 97 Nw. U.L.R. 1315 [pp.1315-1320, 1327-1335].....	350
--	-----

ECO Report, <i>Keep the Door to Environmental Protection Open</i> (Special Report to the Legislative Assembly of Ontario, 1996).....	365
--	-----

D. Macdonald, "The Business Response to Environmentalism" in D. VanNijnatten and R. Boardman, eds., *Canadian Environmental Policy: Context and Cases* (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 2001) [pp. 74-75, 79-81].....374

### *Approvals and Orders*

J. Benedickson, *Environmental Law (2d)* (Toronto: Irwin Law, 2002), Ch. 7:  
"Administrative Compliance Mechanisms".....377

ECO Report, *The EBR Litigation Rights: A Survey of Issues and Six Year Review*  
(Background Paper for EBR Litigation Rights Workshop, 2000) [pp. 1-12].....385

*Re 724597 Ontario Ltd., Re* (1994), 13 C.E.L.R. (N.S.) 257 (O.E.A.B.).....397

*Dillon et al. v. Director, MOE* (2002), 45 C.E.L.R. (N.S.) 9 (O.E.R.T.).....423

### *Prohibitions and Prosecutions*

D. Boyd, *Unnatural Law: Rethinking Canadian Environmental Law and Policy*  
(Vancouver: UBC Press, 2003), Ch. 2.2: "Water Pollution".....454

ECO, *Annual Report 2000/02*, [Excerpts].....461

*R. v. MacMillan Bloedel (Alberni) Ltd.* (1979), 47 C.C.C. (2d) 118 (B.C.C.A.).....474

*Fletcher v. Kingston (City)* (1998), 28 C.E.L.R. (N.S.) 229 (Prov. Div.) [paras. 1-22].....477

*Fletcher v. Kingston (City)* 2004 CarswellOnt 1860 (Ont. C.A.).....482

*R. v. Inco* (2001), 54 O.R. (3d) 495.....499

*R. v. Imperial Oil* (2000), 36 C.E.L.R. (N.S.) 109 (B.C.C.A.).....510

*R. v. Bata Industries Ltd.* (1992), 9 O.R.(3d) 329 (Prov. Div.).....516

*R. v. Bata Industries Ltd* (1995), 25 O.R. (3d) 321 (C.A.).....535

### *Public Participation*

C. Sunstein, *Risk and Reason* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), Ch. 4:  
"This Month's Risk".....541

*B.C. (Minister of Forests) v. Okanagan Indian Band* [2003] 3 S.C.R. 371.....552



C. Tollefson, "Strategic Lawsuits and Environmental Politics: <i>Daishowa Inc. v. Friends of the Lubicon</i> " (1996) 31(1) J. Canadian Studies 119.....	569
<i>Algonquin Wildlands League v. Ontario (MNR)</i> (1996), 21 C.E.L.R. (NS) 102 (Ont. Ct. J., Gen. Div.).....	581
<i>Sierra Club of Canada v. Canada (Minister of Finance)</i> (1998), 13 Admin. L.R. (3d) 280 (Fed. Ct., Trial Div.).....	584
<i>Society for the Preservation of the Englishman River Estuary v. Nanaimo (Regional District)</i> (1999), 28 C.E.L.R. (N.S.) 253 (B.C.S.C.).....	597
<i>Sierra Club of Western Canada v. British Columbia (Attorney General)</i> (1991), 83 D.L.R. (4 <sup>th</sup> ) 708 (B.C.S.C.).....	608
<i>Canadian Parks &amp; Wilderness Society v. Superintendent of Banff National Park</i> (1993), 23 Admin. L.R. (2d) 6 (Fed. Ct., Trial Div.).....	613
<i>Caddy Lake Cottagers Assn. v. Florence-Nora Access Road Inc.</i> (1998), 26 C.E.L.R. (N.S.) 322 (Man. C.A.).....	620
<i>Friends of Point Pleasant Park v. Canada (Attorney General)</i> (2000), 38 C.E.L.R. (N.S.) 45 (Fed. Ct., Trial Div.).....	622
 <b><i>Environmental Assessment</i></b>	
<i>Friends of the Oldman River Society v. Canada (Minister of Transport)</i> (1992), 88 D.L.R. (4 <sup>th</sup> ) 1 (S.C.C.).....	631
<i>Canadian Environmental Assessment Act</i> , S.C. 1992, c. 37, ss. 1-8, 11-40.....	643
Canadian Environmental Assessment Agency, "Basics of Environmental Assessment", <a href="http://www.ceaa-acee.gc.ca/010/basics_e.htm">www.ceaa-acee.gc.ca/010/basics_e.htm</a> .....	680
<i>Citizens' Mining Council of Newfoundland and Labrador Inc. v. Canada (Minister of Environment)</i> [1999] F.C.J. No. 273 (Fed. Ct., Trial Div.) [Excerpts].....	691
<i>Friends of the West Country Assn. v. Canada (Minister of Fisheries and Oceans)</i> [2000] 2 F.C. 263 (C.A.).....	702
<i>Bow Valley Naturalists Society v. Canada (Minister of Canadian Heritage)</i> [2001] 2 F.C. 461 (C.A.).....	721

<i>Inverhuron &amp; District Ratepayers' Assn. v. Canada (Minister of the Environment)</i> [2001] F.C.J. No. 1008 (C.A.).....	750
<i>Canadian Parks and Wilderness Society v. Canada (Minister of Canadian Heritage)</i> [2003] 4 F.C. 672 (C.A.).....	766
<i>Sierra Club of Canada v. Canada (Minister of Fisheries and Oceans)</i> [2003] F.C.J. No. 366 (Trial Div.).....	790
A. Levy, "A Review of Environmental Assessment in Ontario" (2002) 11(2) J.E.L.P. 173 [pp. 173, 194-221].....	808
<i>Sutcliffe v. Ontario (Minister of Environment)</i> (2003), 2 C.E.L.R. (3d) 303 (Div. Ct.)..	823
<i>R. v. Ontario Realty Corporation</i> (Unreported).....	836

## V "NEW" INSTRUMENTS

### *Command and Control v. Economic Instruments*

B. Ackerman and R. Stewart, "Reforming Environmental Law" (1985) 37 Stan. L.R. 1333. [pp. 1333-1341].....	852
W. Wagner, "The Triumph of Technology Based Standards" (2000) U. Ill. L.R. 83....	857
R. Revesz and R. Stavins, "Environmental Law and Policy (Draft Chapter)" for A.M. Polinsky and S. Shavell, eds., <i>The Handbook of Law and Economics</i> (Amsterdam: North-Holland/Elsevier Science, 2004) [pp. 50-54].....	873
Carol Rose, "Rethinking Environmental Controls: Management Strategies for Common Resources" (1991) Duke L.J. 1.....	878

### *Voluntary Mechanisms*

MOE, <i>A Framework for Ontario's Cooperative Agreements</i> , 2003.....	898
K. Harrison, "Voluntarism and Environmental Governance" in E. Parson, ed. <i>Governing the Environment: Persistent Challenges, Uncertain Innovations</i> (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2001) (excerpts).....	915
C. Coglianese, "Is Consensus an Appropriate Basis for Regulatory Policy?" in E. Orts and K. Deketelaere, eds., <i>Environmental Contracts: Comparative Approaches to Regulatory Innovation in the United States and Europe</i> (London: Kluwer Law International, 2001).....	926

### *Green Consumerism*

- K. Harrison and W. Antweiler, "Toxic Release Inventories and Green Consumerism. Empirical Evidence from Canada" (2003) 36(2) *Canadian J. Economics* 495 [pp. 495-500, 518-519].....937
- C. Sunstein, *Risk and Reason* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), Ch. 10: "Tools" [pp. 251-269].....944

### *Marketable Permits*

- R. Stavins, "Market-Based Environmental Policies: What Can We Learn from U.S. Experience (and Related Research)" (July 2, 2003).....950
- J.R. Nash and R. Revesz, "Markets and Geography: Designing Marketable Permit Schemes to Control Local and Regional Pollutants" (2001) 28 *Ecology LQ* 569 [pp. 569-82; 614-29].....968
- L. Heinzerling, "Selling Pollution, Forcing Democracy" (1995) 14 *Stan.Env.L.J.* 300..984
- K. Wyman, "Why Regulators Turn to Tradeable Permits: A Canadian Case Study" (2002) 52 *U.T.L.J.* 419 [pp. 419-426, 487-502].....996
- MOE, Technical Report on Emissions Trading Regime.....1003

## **VI WHERE NOW?**

- James Gustave Speth, *Red Sky at Morning* (Yale University Press 2004) [pp. 191-201].....1009
- T. Anderson and D. Leal, *Free Market Environmentalism* (New York: Palgrave, 2001) [pp. 1-8].....1015
- R. Stewart, "A New Generation Of Environmental Regulation?" (2001), 29 *Cap. U. L. Rev.* 21 [pp. 151-182].....1020

